

The New York Times

# The Opinion Pages

Search All NYTimes.com

Go



Advertise on NYTimes.com

EDITORIAL NOTEBOOK

## The Insanity Defense, Post-Hinckley

By LINCOLN CAPLAN

Published: January 17, 2011

As the country struggles to find meaning in the horrific Tucson shooting, another heated national debate over gun violence comes to mind: the furious reaction to the acquittal, by reason of insanity, of John Hinckley Jr., the man who tried to kill President Ronald Reagan.

Nearly 30 years later, Mr. Hinckley remains in a psychiatric ward, with permission in recent years to leave in his mother's custody for limited visits. After the acquittal, politicians across the country blamed the insanity defense for excusing a detestable and miserable young man from imprisonment. Vowing that it would boost public safety and ensure another Hinckley would not "get off," the federal government and 38 states rewrote their laws, establishing a much more difficult standard of proof.

The most common test had been that a person could be found insane if the defendant "lacks substantial capacity to appreciate the wrongfulness of his conduct or to conform his conduct to the requirements of the law." Most of the new restrictions reduced the test to a simple question: Did the defendant not know what he or she was doing?

A generation later, we know this retrenchment was based on misconceptions, above all that the defense was commonly, and successfully, used. A study of eight states from 1976 to 1987 documented that the defense was employed in less than 1 percent of criminal cases and only a quarter of those defendants were acquitted by reason of insanity.

While the Supreme Court declared in 1983 that such an acquittal was certain proof of dangerousness, that was largely wrong as well. Half the pleas and 35 percent of the acquittals came in cases involving nonviolent offenses; 15 percent of the acquittees were accused of murder. As for insanity acquittees going free, it rarely happened. Nine of 10, whatever the offense, ended up in mental hospitals, some for much longer than they would have been imprisoned.

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

E-MAIL

PRINT

REPRINTS

SHARE

SHARE



Log in to see what your friends are sharing on nytimes.com. Privacy Policy | What's This?

Log In With Facebook

### What's Popular Now

Aftermath of the Earthquake and Tsunami in Japan - Photographs



Waves Hit Hawaii and Head Toward California



Click to use Flash

John Hinckley Jr., suicidal and haunted by violent stories from movies and novels, said he shot President Reagan to win the attention of the actress Jodie Foster and become famous. The prosecution and defense agreed that he was seriously mentally ill at the time of the shooting. The trial was about whether he was sick enough to be found insane.

Medicine defines illness, the law, responsibility. The fields long tried to resolve their differences scientifically. After the Hinckley verdict, politics undermined that quest.

A version of this editorial appeared in print on January 18, 2011, on page A24 of the New York edition.

E-MAIL

PRINT

REPRINTS

Click to use Flash

Advertise on NYTimes.com

Click here to get 50% off Home Delivery of The New York Times.

Ads by Google

what's this?

### Brazilian Beaches

Beaches with sun and heat all year round. Brazil is calling  
Braziltour.com

#### Get Free E-mail Alerts on These Topics

Hinckley, John W Jr

Mental Health and Disorders

Assassinations and Attempted Assassinations

Courts

Sections Home Search Skip to content

## The New York Times

### MOST POPULAR

E-MAILED BLOGGED SEARCHED VIEWED

1. David Brooks: The Modesty Manifesto
2. State of the Art: Appeal of iPad 2 Is a Matter of Emotions
3. Paul Krugman: Dumbing Deficits Down
4. Photo Editing Online, Easy as Pie
5. Movie Review | 'Jane Eyre': Radiant Spirit Blossoms in Barren Land
6. House Proud: A Glow in the Desert
7. Devastation as Tsunami Crashes Into Japan
8. Eat: Winner, Winner, Chicken Dinner
9. Idaho Rancher Revealed as Gangster From Boston
10. Roger Cohen: Green Cuisine in Legoland

Go to Complete List »



### Pressure to curb school taxes

ALSO IN BUSINESS »

- Are we prepared for rising gas prices?
- Continental ends free snacks

nytimes.com

BUSINESS

ADVERTISEMENTS



Exclusive offers delivered to your inbox

The New York Times

**Some Promise You the World. We Deliver.**

Save 50% on home delivery. **Click now.**

Book Review

Ads by Google

what's this?

### Indaba Music

Edit & mix your music online. See a demo & get a pro account for \$50.

[www.indabamusic.com](http://www.indabamusic.com)

## INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



### WORLD »



New Iraq Mosque Buys Spirits, but Splits Loom

### THEATER »



A Broadway Makeover for 'Priscilla' Queens

### OPINION »

## What Is the Terrorism Threat Now?

A Room for Debate forum on how well law enforcement tracks domestic terrorist groups.

### TRAVEL »



36 Hours in São Paulo, Brazil

### OPINION »



Op-Ed: Let There Be More Efficient Light

### ARTS »



Messages That Conduct an Electric Charge

[Home](#) | [World](#) | [U.S.](#) | [N.Y. / Region](#) | [Business](#) | [Technology](#) | [Science](#) | [Health](#) | [Sports](#) | [Opinion](#) | [Arts](#) | [Style](#) | [Travel](#) | [Jobs](#) | [Real Estate](#) | [Autos](#) | [Back to Top](#)

© 2011 The New York Times Company | [Privacy](#) | [Your Ad Choices](#) | [Terms of Service](#) | [Corrections](#) | [RSS](#) | [First Look](#) | [Help](#) | [Contact Us](#) | [Work for Us](#) | [Advertise](#) | [Site Map](#)